Continuous Feedback Pedagogical Patterns

Kathleen A. Larson (klar3418@my.msmc.edu)
Frances P. Trees (ftrees@drew.edu)
D. Scott Weaver (SWeaver@messiah.edu)

October 2008
Introduction:

Successful teachers recognize there is more to teaching than mastering content. Content can be learned. Although mastering the subject content is necessary, it is not sufficient for success as a teacher. Teaching requires massive amounts of planning, careful attention to learning styles, design of authentic assessment tools, and continuous self-evaluation of the success of each lesson. Concern for student learning is the central theme. Over time, teachers develop a repertoire of best practices, classroom skills, and methods that have proven effective for them. Successful teachers are passionate about their subject and their profession. This passion is nourished by the sharing among one another of successful teaching techniques.

The teaching patterns presented here were gathered from our collective experience in the classroom and those we have observed among our colleagues. Several of these patterns can be adapted for use in any classroom, from primary grades through adult education. For very young children, the teacher has the added task of actually teaching the children the mechanics of the pattern, keeping everything very simple, demonstrating what she expects, walking the students through the process, and gradually teaching them how to work cooperatively with each other.

One goal of a successful teacher is to develop an environment of trust and collaboration in which students feel comfortable and confident enough to actively participate. The patterns presented in this paper focus on continuous feedback. Some patterns involve direct feedback from the teacher to the student while other patterns involve feedback from the students to the teacher. These patterns complement the Feedback Patterns and Active Learning Patterns described in the current work of the Pedagogical Patterns Community [1].
Overview of Continuous Feedback Patterns

Learning Contract: Require students to be responsible for their own learning.

Move Around: Teach from all parts of the classroom rather than being glued to the front.

Crafted Questions: Carefully construct questions to accompany lessons.

Simple Answer: Construct some easy answer questions to build student confidence.

Open Ended: Construct some questions to activate higher level thinking.

Think...Pair...Share: Give students time to formulate an answer, talk it over with another student, and then present their considered response to the class.

Pregnant Pause: Allow students time to digest a question and respond.

Listen: Allow students time to complete a response rather than finishing for them.

Three Stars and a Wish: Find three positive things to say about student work before giving a criticism.

Look But Do Not Touch: Help students solve a problem but don’t do it for them.

Delve the Depths: Allow for unexpected responses and investigate student thought processes.

Tell Me About It: Periodically collect student journals reflecting on what they have learned during the time period.

Piece of Mind: Provide students an opportunity to anonymously give you feedback.

The following diagram illustrates the interrelationships among these patterns.
Although these patterns focus on an educational environment, many of them are applicable to any situation where feedback is involved. For example, your colleague successfully uses a technique to increase active participation in his university classroom. You realize that you can employ this same technique in conducting a meeting of your local service organization or in your business. Ideally, many of the patterns we present in this paper will have applications beyond that of the classroom environment.
Learning Contract

Students take responsibility for their own learning.

Problem

How can you ensure students will carefully read the course syllabus?

Context

On the first day of a college (and possibly secondary school) class students are given a copy of the course syllabus.

Forces

Students don’t think of the course syllabus as an important document. A few may read the whole document, but many students look only at the schedule and grading scale. If the teacher goes over the document in class, they tune out. Teachers need their students to read the syllabus so the students are aware of their responsibilities as learners. Students need to read the syllabus so they understand their teacher’s expectations. When the course ends, students who have not read the syllabus often “blame” the teacher for a poor grade.

You, the teacher, expect students to understand the course objectives and their responsibilities as stated in the syllabus.

Solution

When the syllabus is handed out, tell the students to read it carefully. Go over the important points and explain that the syllabus represents your promise to them. Tell the students to think of the syllabus as a contract. Say “My part of the contract is to deliver this course content to you to the best of my ability. This is my half of our contract.” Tell them before the next class they are to write their half of the contract, their promise to you. This “learning contract” should include the grade the student wants to earn in the course and exactly what he or she will do to earn that grade, responding to each item in the syllabus point by point, as in a contract. Remind them this is not about how they feel or about how they did in other courses. It’s a contract listing their acceptance of responsibilities for their learning.

Rationale

The “Learning Contract” requires students to read the syllabus carefully, becoming aware of course requirements for academics, attendance, behavior, and other expectations you have included. By writing the contract they specify their responsibilities in the learning process.

Example

Terri teaches Curriculum Planning and Instruction to prospective teachers in the Education Department of a small college. On the first day of class she hands out a copy of the syllabus, briefly discusses the main points, tells the students what is important to her in assessing their work, and says the syllabus represents her promise, her half of a contract, of what she will deliver to them throughout the course. She then tells the students they are to carefully read the syllabus, decide the grade they plan to achieve, and write a contract to her listing the grade and, point by point, what they will do to achieve it. This is their contract back to Terri. She provides a template and an example of the type of document she expects from her students and tells them the contract is due at the beginning of the next class. Contracts are signed by both parties and copies are given to both.
Kathy uses Learning Contracts in her Introduction to Programming class and her Introduction to Statistics class in the same way Terri does in her education courses. Throughout the course Kathy reminds students about the contract they made with her.

**Consequences**

Students are more responsible. They understand your expectations and their role in the learning process. You must also take responsibility for delivering content and taking different learning styles into consideration. Students and teacher work together.

If a good example is not provided, students do not know how to write a contract. They will simply tell you their life story about how they have traditionally worked in other classes or how unfair grading has been. You must provide a template, yet not include so much help that they copy your example without reading the syllabus. The goal is for them to study the syllabus and respond to it in their own words.

At the time of year when the Learning Contract is assigned, the teacher is very busy setting up the course. Collecting and responding to each student’s Learning Contract is one more time consuming task in the teacher’s already packed day. The teacher must believe this assignment will pay dividends in the long run to invest the extra effort required at this time.

Regardless of the importance the teacher places on the Learning Contract, some students may still treat it as busy work and not understand how a thoughtful response can contribute to a better grade in the course.
Move Around

Walk around the room and show an interest in what each student is doing to overcome an uninviting physical classroom where students can easily lose focus.

Problem

How can you foster a friendly atmosphere where everyone participates and everyone is focused on the lesson?

Context

You are in a classroom where there is a board/screen/podium in the front of the room with rows of desks facing the board, in a lab where computers are situated around the perimeter of the room, or in a lecture hall where students are seated in theater style fixed rows.

Forces

Students learn when they are engaged in the lesson. Teachers are more aware of those students who actively participate.

Some teachers find security by always standing behind a podium in the front of the classroom and being close only to those sitting in the front seats. There is a limited number of “front seats” in your classroom. Not all students can sit in the front of the room where they are recognized and called on frequently by the teacher. Students in the back of the room lose focus more easily than those in the front. Students in the front of the room tend to pay attention partly because of the proximity of the teacher. Spatial separation between the teacher and the students creates a sense of distance that can be interpreted by the student as disinterest in what the student is doing. Spatial separation can lead to distracted, unfocused students, classroom management issues, and an unfriendly atmosphere.

Solution

Move to different parts of the room during instruction. Engage the students as you travel around the room. Know what each student is working on. Be human. Make eye contact with each student to confirm to them that you are interested in what they are doing.

Rationale

Communication between two people improves when we are in close physical proximity to the other person. The other person can’t ignore us nor remain detached as easily when we are nearby. By being in close proximity of each student, you convey to them that the sense of learning is everywhere in the room, not just in the front of the room.

Example

During a computer lab, Fran used the computer projector to view lecture slides for developing a personal web page. The projection computer is on the podium in the front of the room and there is no remote to advance the slides. After advancing each slide, she walked around the room to view the work of several students, walking in different areas of the classroom while she explained the material presented on the slide. The students were aware that she was making sure that they understood the steps presented on the slides.
**Consequences**

A classroom where teachers are interested and aware of what the students are doing contributes to a well-managed classroom where students are engaged in the lesson. Eliminating spatial distance minimizes teacher-student barriers.

Make sure you do not overdo the walking around in the traditional classroom or lecture hall that has blackboards, whiteboards, and presentation computers that are stationary and not uniformly distributed. In these situations, moving around during your lectures can lose visual elements and be more difficult for students to follow.
Crafted Questions

Spend time before class preparing questions for your lecture.

Problem

How can you design questions that motivate students to participate and engage in the lesson?

Context

You are in a teaching situation where students are focused on you, whether because you are lecturing, or giving instructions. You are ready to introduce a new concept but you want to make sure that previous material has been understood.

Forces

Not all students readily contribute to class discussions or answer difficult questions about the material presented in class. Some students, because of their personality, will readily participate. Others may be shy or fearful of looking foolish by answering questions incorrectly. Some questions, because of ambiguity, confuse the students making them feel stupid because they do not understand the questions being asked. Students want to answer questions correctly and will hesitate if they are unsure of the intended answer. For the most part, however, students who come to class want to learn.

Your class time is limited and the amount of material you must cover may limit the amount of time you can spend on student interaction.

Solution

Spend time prior to class developing SimpleAnswer and OpenEnded questions whose answers have been discussed in previous classes.

When developing a question, write down all possible answers to that question. Refine the question in such a way that there is one and only one correct answer. Your goal is to make each question unambiguous so that students will feel confident in answering it.

Later in the course, after you have developed an atmosphere of trust and participation, develop more thought-provoking questions and use DelveTheDepths to explore alternate approaches to student interaction.

Rationale

Students keep focused when they are actively involved in the class. Good questioning techniques help to develop an atmosphere of active participation and help students develop a better understanding of the course material.

Example

In a programming class the topic of discussion is the difference between classes and objects. Prior to the class, Scott sat down and developed some SimpleAnswer questions to be used in the class. “Looking around the room we see lots of ‘things’. If I choose one, is it a class or an object? Susan for example, is she a class or an object?” The correct answer would be, “Object.” Scott writes the follow up, “Right, she’s an object. How do we reference her?” He makes a note that the correct answer would be, “By her name, Susan.”

As Scott reflected on those SimpleAnswer questions, he realized that the initial question may cause problems within the class. Calling Susan an object isn’t flattering and may be offensive.
He decided to change the question and reference a book a student has on his desk. The questions that follow use the book instead of Susan.

**Consequences**

Asking good, well-planned questions in class gives the students an opportunity to participate and receive immediate feedback. They are encouraged to take an active role in the class. The teacher is prepared and as the questions are asked, receives a better understanding of what the students are learning.

However, students may answer the questions incorrectly. During those situations it is important to appreciate the student’s attempt to answer while gently indicating the answer is incorrect. In this situation, the teacher may also find that the students do not understand the material and the presentation may have to change to accommodate them.
Simple Answer

When students are actively engaged in a class, they are more likely to learn the material. Design some questions to have a simple answer to draw out student response.

Problem

How can you ask questions that motivate students to interact with you while boosting their confidence and understanding?

Context

You are in a teaching situation where students are focused on you because you are lecturing or giving instructions. You are ready to introduce a new concept but you want to make sure that previous material has been understood.

Forces

Your goal is getting students involved in discussions. You aim to develop a classroom atmosphere that fosters trust and encourages participation. For a variety of reasons, students avoid contributing to the class discussion or answering questions. Some students lack confidence in their understanding and would rather keep silent than answer a question with an incorrect response.

Many students desire a class that is dynamic in which they can participate and learn. They usually enter a class timidly, self-conscious of how they come across. With a lack of confidence, they do not contribute and cause the class to be quiet and lethargic. The energy you bring to the class does little to raise the energy level of the entire class.

Solution

Prior to the class, develop a series of “close-ended” questions based on your lesson requiring short or single-word answers. Start with questions whose answers are easy and simple and can be answered from material you have just covered in class. Ask these questions continuously throughout your lesson. Think of this as a first step toward increased student involvement.

Further steps can be cultivated with SimpleAnswer, followed by OpenEnded, as long as you continue to apply CraftedQuestions. If you utilize these patterns and still find it difficult to engage students, try using PregnantPause or PieceOfMind along with the others.

Rationale

Though this may seem like a “regurgitation” of material at the lowest level of thinking, you are fostering an environment of confidence and participation. Students keep focused when they are engaged in the class. Simply listening does not constitute active learning. Students' minds tend to wander when all they do is listen while you talk. An atmosphere of trust and participation develops when you actively involve students. When students are able to positively interact, a level of confidence is developed that will lead to more active learning and more interaction.

Example

Angela is teaching students in a programming class to write a counting loop. She first asks, “What do you do throughout your day that you do repeatedly?” She follows that up with asking them how many times they repeat that task. As she continues with the lesson, she
chooses one of their repetitious tasks, juggling a soccer ball. She then asks them to name the variable we will use for counting. She asks if it would be appropriate to start counting at 15. None of the students agree with that. “That would be cheating,” one replies. So Angela tells them their counting variable will be assigned an initial value of zero.

Angela continues in this fashion, asking SimpleAnswer questions that draw students into the lecture. She encourages everyone to respond and gives “happy” feedback to each student who answers a question. She smiles as she sees other students with their hands in the air and acknowledges them with positive reinforcement by saying, “Is that what you were going to say?”

Consequences

Students in your classroom are actively engaged and willing to risk involvement in class discussions. As they experience positive feedback from you, even when an answer isn’t exactly what you wanted to hear, they will be more likely to continue to express their thoughts. Moreover, there will be improvement in student understanding and retention rate of course material as well as an increase in the energy level in the class.

Because the answers are simple, students may tend to shout out the answers. You want them to participate, but you also want to give as many students an opportunity to participate as you can.

Too many questions that have simple answers may patronize students causing the opposite reaction. Because you are treating them below their intelligence, they may quit interaction all together.
Open Ended

Prior to class, develop a set of “open-ended” questions, questions that require a full, meaningful answer using the student's previously acquired knowledge and/or feelings.

Problem

How can you motivate students to incorporate their experiences and understanding, using higher level thinking skills, into your discussions?

Context

You are teaching a class of students with whom you have developed an environment of participation using SimpleAnswer. You are entering the class with something you want to communicate to your students. The students may have experiences that relate in some way to the subject of your lesson.

Forces

Some students feel safe in answering questions that relate directly to the material just presented.

Students come to class with varied experiences and rich opportunities to connect what you are teaching with those experiences. Students seldom reflect on what is being communicated with what they have experienced and need a little help in making those connections.

You want to include student experiences as part of the lesson, giving their experiences validity.

Solution

In order to generate more thorough student responses, a different type of CraftedQuestions is required. Prior to class, develop a set of “open-ended” questions, questions that require a full, meaningful answer using the student's previously acquired knowledge and/or feelings. Start with simple, open-ended questions and if the students respond well, follow that with more challenging, thought-provoking questions. Use DelveTheDepths to encourage alternate responses.

Rationale

Learning is about the student connecting concepts with ideas and truths he has already learned. In a classroom lecture when participation is limited or non-existent, the student has no way of externalizing the process and no one to validate the connections. It is important to have students express what they are learning externally so that you can validate these connections for them.

Having students answer questions related to the material just presented is learning because it has engaged the student. However, simply parroting a reply that they have already heard is far from higher levels of thinking or learning.

Example

In David’s programming class, students have been responding well. They were actively involved in the class answering SimpleAnswer questions David has developed. David knows they understand the basic difference between a class and an object but he wants them to be able to articulate the difference. So, prior to class David uses CraftedQuestions, and came up with the follow-up question, “So, what is the difference between a class and an object?” He
decides to use *PregnantPause* after posing the question to give students an opportunity to think and develop a response.

**Consequences**

After asking the *OpenEnded* question(s) and using *PregnantPause*, students are given an opportunity to process what they have learned. They are connecting what they’ve heard with things they already know. When a student gives the correct answer she becomes more confident in what she knows because of the connections she has made.

However, if the *OpenEnded* question is beyond the student’s ability, she may get frustrated with her lack of understanding.
Think…Pair…Share

To introduce a lesson and focus students’ attention on the topic, pose a question, allow students a minute or two to think about their response, two minutes to pair with another student to discuss their responses, and three or four minutes for the partners to share one another’s responses with the whole class.

Problem

How can you quickly focus students’ attention on your lesson and away from distractions?

Context

It’s time for class to begin. You might be a primary grades teacher and your students have just arrived in the morning, or they might be returning to the classroom from recess, lunch, or a pull-out program such as art, music, or gym. Or you might be a secondary school teacher or college professor and class periods have just changed.

Forces

Students’ natural inclination is to continue thinking about interests other than the class and to postpone involvement in the lesson. They are in conversation with friends, concerned about personal issues, or planning the rest of their day. You, on the other hand, have a great deal of knowledge to impart and want their undivided attention.

Solution

Immediately pose a question that focuses the students’ attention on the lesson to be taught. Use CraftedQuestions to engage student participation. Use PregnantPause while they think about the question and write down their answers privately. After one minute tell the students to pair with one other person and discuss their answers. After two minutes call on members of the class randomly and ask them to share with the class their partner’s answer. Allow three minutes for sharing, calling on as many members of the class as possible. Ask if anyone who did not answer would care to share her partner’s response with the class. Then continue with the lesson.

Rationale

This activity accomplishes four goals for the beginning of a lesson. The think part grabs the students’ attention away from whatever they were thinking about just before class began. It focuses their attention on a question related to the topic of the day, motivating them to learn. The carefully CraftedQuestion activates their prior knowledge about the topic, thus improving the probability that the new material will relate to something they already know and will more likely be retained. The sharing part of the activity gives you insight into where the students are coming from and shapes the direction you will take in teaching the lesson. This is diagnostic assessment and is crucial to the effective teaching of the lesson.

Think…Pair…Share can also be used during the course of instruction to focus students’ attention on an aspect of the lesson. This allows you to perform formative assessment (ongoing assessment) and modify the lesson to meet student needs and learning styles.

Example

Allison wants to introduce a unit about Ethan Frome to her tenth grade English Language Arts class. She decides one focus of the novel is Ethan’s desire for various things, so at the beginning of class she writes the word “desire” on the board and asks her students to take a
moment to jot down one time when they desired something and didn’t get it and one time when they desired something and did get it. After a minute or two she instructs the students to pair with a student near them and tell each other the events they remember. She allows them two minutes and then calls on pairs randomly to share one another’s desires with the whole class. After this she tells the class they are going to study a story about one man’s desires and what happened to him.

John uses **Think…Pair…Share** when he wants to pause in a lecture and provide time for students to assimilate new material. This breaks up the lecture and provides feedback about student learning. John pauses during a slide presentation on the forces that caused the United States to enter World War II and asks his eleventh grade American History students to jot down one parallel force they think led to United States involvement in the current conflict in the Middle East. After a minute the students pair to discuss their responses. Then each pair joins another pair and the group is given two minutes to select one contributing factor among those discussed. Each group shares their choice and why it was selected with the class and John helps them relate their responses to the lesson on the slides and to factors that, in general, contribute to a country going to war. He then continues the slide presentation.

**Consequences**

When practices such as this are a regular part of the lesson, students come to class expecting to become involved immediately. The tone for the class is set. Students expect to interact with one another and with you, the instructor. They believe you are interested in their learning and they become eager learners. The result is more effective teaching and learning.

This exercise takes several minutes. In a traditional 45 minute class period, teachers worry about any activity that uses up several minutes of the time needed to present new material. There is a time trade-off but it may result in increased student learning.

Students may also use the share time to talk with their friend in class about other things not related to the question. However, since you have explained to the class that you expect each pair to be ready to share, call on those who seem to have been discussing other things. After using this pattern often, students realize they do need to be ready to give an answer after the few minutes of pair time.
**Pregnant Pause**

Wait long enough for students to think about a question and formulate an answer before continuing with a lesson.

**Problem**

How do you successfully and consistently give students the time to formulate a response to higher level questions?

**Context**

You have developed a lesson you want to communicate to students. Your students are generally quiet. You want to ask higher level questions to get your students to think about the subject matter.

**Forces**

You are using CraftedQuestions, SimpleAnswer and/or OpenEnded, allowing the students to participate. However, no one in the class is eager to respond. You ask a question and you're met with silence. When you pose a question, no one is quick to answer.

In many classes, students are reluctant to jump at answering your questions. Students may not want to appear to be a “teacher’s pet” or a “know it all” and are concerned that showing eagerness to answer questions will label them as such. The questions may be perceived as too difficult by students unaccustomed to applying higher level thinking skills.

You feel the need to fill the silence and have the very strong urge to give the answer to the question yourself. It feels awkward having dead air. You also have a limited amount of time to present your material and engage the students.

**Solution**

You ask a student a high-level question and the student remains silent. If you have used CraftedQuestions and know students are capable, then silently count to 60 before calling on a student for an answer. This allows silence to occur giving all students an opportunity to formulate a response. This also causes some discomfort on the part of some students, which may be a good thing. It puts all students in a position of participating.

**Rationale**

Students need time to think about the question and put it into the context of what they know. They need time to formulate an answer before they volunteer. It is human nature to feel awkward when there is a silence that is unexpected. This is true with both teachers and students. When that tension is felt, someone will fill the void. Unfortunately, too often it is the teacher rather than the student. Forcing yourself to wait a longer period of time will give the students the opportunity to fill the void.

**Example**

In David's Programming class, students have responded well. They are actively involved in the class answering SimpleAnswer questions. They understand the basic difference between a class and an object, so David used the follow-up OpenEnded question, “So what is the difference between a class and an object?” He used PregnantPause after posing the question to give students an opportunity to think and develop a response. By the time David finished counting to 60, several students had their hands raised, ready to answer his question. David
gave each of them an opportunity to give their explanation, finding something positive in each on which to commend them.

**Consequences**

The students who answered had ample time to contemplate the question and came up with correct, insightful answers in their own words and their own contexts.

Sometime, however, you may have students that are completely off the mark. You can’t allow their answer to confuse the other students, so you have to indicate the answer is wrong. However, you want to encourage the student for participating and trying.

Other times, students will call out answers that are wrong. These, too, need to be addressed so that students do not get the impression that the wrong answer may be valid.
Listen

Listen to student responses without interruption.

Problem

How can a student most benefit from responding to a question or participating in a class discussion?

Context

You are teaching a course in which students are encouraged to participate in class discussions, ask questions, and volunteer responses.

Forces

A student needs time to formulate and express her thoughts. You are sometimes impatient when students are providing answers to questions or contributing to discussions.

When a student begins an answer to your question, you want to interrupt and complete the thought for the student because you are in agreement and you think you can anticipate what the student is about to say.

When you interrupt a student, the student assumes that you are interrupting to correct their answer. Some students may feel belittled or humiliated when interrupted which can result in fewer, if any, contributions from the student.

You know the student's answer is off track and you are anxious to discuss the correct solution with the class.

When interrupted, the student may be either too polite or too intimidated by your expertise and authority to continue her thought even if her response differs from the way you completed the sentence she started.

Solution

When a student is speaking, allow that student to complete his or her response. Follow up with ThreeStars or DelveTheDepths. Listen to all students with an equal amount of interest and solicit responses. Give your feedback to the student at appropriate times, not in the middle of the student's thought but rather when the student has completed his response.

Rationale

It is rude to interrupt someone when they are speaking. Interrupting a student when the student is contributing to a class discussion or answering a question can make the student feel that her response needs to be interpreted or clarified. Respect should be mutual. As the teacher, you usually do not tolerate students interrupting you. Students should be treated with the same respect you expect from them. Given time to think as she responds, your student is better able to define what she is trying to say. Although the start of a student response may not say much, once the student continues with an explanation, the meaning may become clear. Jumping in before the student finishes may rob her of the full benefit of externalizing her connection to the lesson and shortchange her learning. In fact, listening to a student’s complete response often gives you insight into how your students perceive your lesson. The student’s perspective may help you to see your lesson in a different light.
*Example*

Steve asked his CS2 students to help him write a segment of code to solve a problem. One student started to suggest a very advanced and elegant solution. Steve was so thrilled with the student's response that he was tempted to write the code on the board before (or while) the student was explaining the procedure. He thought about what he was doing, paused, and listened to the entire solution before he wrote the code on the board.

Fran was teaching a computer science class and asked for suggestions for an algorithm for replacing information in a sparse array implementation of a grid. One student began explaining a very elementary and inefficient solution. Although she knew that the student was not on the right track, she allowed the student to complete their suggestion and then used DelveTheDepths to encourage the student to see an alternative, more efficient solution.

*Consequences*

Students will understand that their contributions to class discussions are encouraged and valued. They will not fear being cut-off before they finish sharing their thoughts.

This can, however, allow students to drone on and on so that other students lose focus.
Three Stars And A Wish

When grading assignments, tell each student three things you liked about the work and one “wish” for improvement.

Problem
How can you correct student errors and give feedback without causing your students to become defensive, disheartened, or angry?

Context
You are grading a student’s written paper, oral presentation, or project and you see that there are definite problems that need to be corrected.

Forces
Some students become discouraged and give up when their errors are pointed out to them. It’s difficult to receive negative feedback. What may seem like simple corrections to the teacher may be received as devastating news by the student. When the teacher tells a student there is something wrong with an assignment, the student’s ego is deflated and he may become resentful, defensive, or discouraged.

The teacher needs to correct the student but doesn’t want the student to drop the course.

Solution
Identify three things you like about the student’s work. List those as three stars. Then tell the student “I wish you had done …” saying what you would like the student to do differently. As difficult as it may seem, you can always find at least one positive thing to say about a student’s work and if you look hard you’ll come up with three.

Rationale
Giving feedback in a way that will encourage a student to correct the problem and try harder is a challenge. We all want to think when we’ve invested time and effort into our work that it will be well received. If the teacher first points out three positives about the student’s work, hearing one negative isn’t as disheartening. At least the teacher found something good to say, and the student accepts the “wish” as advice rather than criticism.

Example
Kathleen requires her students to make presentations to the whole class using Power Point slides. She has found that many times students are nervous, the slides contain too much text, students read everything directly from the slides, or the information may be questionable. In grading her students, Kathleen makes it a policy to first find three things that were done at least at an acceptable level. For example, the title may have caught the listener’s attention, the presentation may have been logically organized, or the slides may have been right on topic. Then she adds a “wish” that the most glaring error the student committed (I wish your slides had not contained so much text) will be corrected. Sometimes Kathleen actually sneaks in multiple errors, couched in language that comes back to the student as a single “wish.” (I wish you had written only an outline of your talk on each slide and filled in the text as you talked from memory so that the slides would have been less crowded and the print would have been large enough for everyone in the room to read.) Students are much more appreciative of criticism in this format than they are of receiving a list of their mistakes and Kathleen finds they work harder than ever to improve their work.
**Consequences**

This solution is especially effective when a student’s work is public, either a classroom presentation or work posted on a discussion forum, and all members of the class can give Three Stars and a Wish to the presenter. The stars and wishes will differ from one fellow student to another, so the student in question receives a variety of positive feedback but also hears about several items that need to be corrected.

One difficulty for a teacher occurs when there are several glaring errors. How does the teacher make just one wish? One way around this problem is the procedure described in the paragraph above. Choose the most egregious error for your wish. Encourage everyone in the class to give Three Stars and a Wish to one another, and hope the class points out the errors you chose to overlook. You can also sometimes sneak more than one wish into your response to a student by carefully wording what you say. A third possibility is to wish the student would meet with you to discuss possible misunderstandings about the assignment.

Some students may react to the word “wish” by not making the improvement. The student may say to himself, “Ahhh, the teacher didn’t require the change. It’s only a suggestion.” Such an attitude can be discouraged by class discussion about the value of a “wish.” Discuss how the wish is a strong suggestion intended to help them turn in their best possible work and earn a better grade on future assignments. Remind them that correcting errors will help them beyond this course.
**Look, But Do Not Touch**

When students are having difficulty attacking a problem, assist by offering guidance, not by solving the problem for the student.

**Problem**

How can you assist the student that is experiencing difficulties solving problems or programming without depriving him from the discovery learning that would allow him to draw on his own experiences and prior knowledge to solve the problem?

**Context**

While you are assisting students during a lab or problem session, you notice that a student stops working because he has no clue as to what to do next. Or a student asked for help on a problem and would like you to show her.

**Forces**

Students learn more through active participation [3, 4] and they usually want to participate. You want your student to be successful, to finish this problem, and to move on to the others. The easiest thing to do is to take the keyboard (or pencil) from the student and demonstrate how this problem is done by doing it for the student. If you do all the work and solve all of the problems, the students are deprived from active learning. If you do not help the student, the problem may never be completed. Some students would rather be done with the problem and would prefer you to complete it for them.

**Solution**

When students have difficulty with programming or solving problems, assist by offering suggestions and advice, not by writing out the solution for the student or taking control of the keyboard.

**Rationale**

Students are encouraged to ask questions, seek advice, and work together. If too many answers are given too easily, the student never experiences the struggles that are necessary for success. The student will remember more and learn more by doing rather than watching.

**Example**

A student asked for help when he was writing a computer science program. The student did not know how to begin the problem and he was not a great typist. After guiding the student through a few steps and watching the student struggle with the keyboard skills, Kathy was very tempted to take the keyboard and type the correct code for the student. Instead, she verbally gave a few hints and asked a few pointed questions to guide the student in the right direction. She told the student that she would return in a few minutes after she answered another student's question. She returned every so often, as promised, to check on the first student's progress and was careful not to leave him with a feeling of abandonment. When needed, she gave this student additional guidance until the student was able to work on his own.

**Consequences**

Students learn that the main goal is to solve the problem themselves. Students are active learners and not passive bystanders. Teachers learn patience.
There may be times when you can't find a way to lead the student to the solution without giving them the answer. In that case, discuss the answer and use DelveTheDepths to involve the student in the learning process.
Delve the Depths

Applaud alternative solutions to problems.

**Problem**

What do you do when a student catches you off guard by presenting a solution to a problem or answering a question in a way you didn’t anticipate?

**Context**

You ask a question or you have a student go to the board to write out a solution to a problem. The student responds in a way that you never considered. You immediately turn to other students looking for the expected response, overlooking or ignoring the first student’s answer.

**Forces**

You have a set answer in mind and have not considered alternative ways of approaching the question. The student answers from another perspective or has a different insight into the question than you had considered.

The student receives negative feedback when his answer isn’t given consideration. The student is less likely to risk answering in the future. The rest of the class learns that there is only one right way to solve the problem.

Students come from a variety of backgrounds. When they participate, they do not purposefully answer the question incorrectly. When they step out of their comfort zone to answer a question, they are trying hard to get it right.

**Solution**

Give consideration to each student’s response. Ask the student to explain his thought process. Take time to analyze the response. Use *PregnantPause* to give the students time to think. Compare and contrast several students’ solutions. Praise them for their creative ideas and for seeing the problem from different perspectives.

**Rationale**

Sometimes a perfectly good student answer to a question is dismissed because it is not the answer you expected. You fail to recognize that the student’s answer might have merit. When this occurs, a teaching moment, an opportunity to delve the depths of understanding is lost.

A classroom where students are free to contribute their ideas and be taken seriously is a classroom where real learning can take place. Students are encouraged to take a risk, to think outside the box, and to verbalize their thought processes.

**Example**

Kathy asks a question that requires logical reasoning. She expects to hear deductive solutions but one student offers an inductive solution. She uses this student’s reasoning to demonstrate the two methods and applaud all the students for using good reasoning skills.

**Consequences**

The classroom models a positive learning environment. Students are encouraged to apply their learning to new situations and to synthesize one concept with others they have studied, moving across disciplines. Teachers and students celebrate new learning
**DelvingTheDepths** can divert you from your lesson plan, taking more time away from your planned activities.
Tell Me About It

Students periodically submit a journal reflecting upon what they have learned and how they might apply new learning in their lives.

Problem

How do you encourage your students to make connections between new material and concepts they have previously learned and to apply the new material to real life situations?

Context

You are concerned that your students may learn the material in your lessons in a superficial way.

Forces

There is pressure on students to get through a course with minimal effort. Students memorize what they think they need to know to pass, not taking time to reflect upon what they are learning. Making connections to what they already know and how to apply the new material to their lives takes effort. Students have the time pressures of other courses, work, family responsibilities, and other obligations.

Teachers want students to reflect upon new learning and consider how they will apply concepts beyond the immediate lesson. Teachers want feedback from students.

Solution

Have students submit a reflective journal every two or three weeks in which they tell the reader about what they have learned during that period of time. This journal is not a diary. Rather than listing knowledge learned day by day or copying a summary from the end of a textbook chapter, instruct the students to reflect on course readings, activities, and assignments in terms of higher level thinking skills such as application, synthesis, evaluation, and formulating hypotheses. You may ask them to begin a sentence with “I believe …” or “In my judgment …,” requiring them to evaluate what has been learned and apply it to their own situation. Encourage students to include questions they feel were inadequately addressed during class. You may also ask them to identify some aspect of the material studied and connect it to an experience or topic outside the course subject matter. Provide students with a copy of the grading rubric prior to writing their journal. Along with the journal, students include a copy of the rubric on which they grade themselves. Grade the journals and give each student personal feedback.

Rationale

This type of journal forces students to consider what they have learned over a recent time period. Students are required to activate higher level thinking skills and to reflect upon their learning in a meaningful way. This accomplishes two main goals. It causes them to relate new learning to prior and future learning. It provides a tool for review of course material, thus helping students to prepare for examinations with a better understanding of course content. Having students self-evaluate according to the rubric ensures they are aware of and attempt to meet the criteria.

Example

Joan gives her class the following assignment: Write a journal in which you reflect upon the first three weeks of this course. Include substantive reactions to the readings, thoughtful
reactions to class discussions and activities, and insightful applications of course content to future goals. Your journal should have a reflective title, thoughtful discussion of major course concepts, and a summary evaluation of the course so far. You will also be graded on an appealing visual presentation, grammar, spelling, and writing style.

Kathy instructs her Introduction to Statistics college students to submit a journal reflecting upon what they have learned throughout a unit of study prior to an examination on the unit. She reminds them to analyze the origin of the formulas introduced in the unit, explain the reasoning of step-by-step solutions, and to write about applying the unit to their particular field of interest. Students write about what they have learned and what they do not yet understand. Kathy returns individual responses, but if there seems to be a common misunderstanding, she corrects this by re-teaching some material prior to the exam.

**Consequences**

Students are more aware of the meaning and application of the course to their lives. They are involved in their own learning and do more than memorize facts. They synthesize concepts and connect them to previous learning. This type of journal writing has been successful with students of all ages and in a variety of courses. Even young children can be taught to write very simple reflective journals that help them begin to develop higher level thinking skills.

If graded carefully, journals require many hours of the teacher’s time. Having provided a rubric, the teacher must now follow the rubric carefully as she grades. This is a time-consuming process.
**Piece of Mind**

Gain insight into your class by having your students anonymously answer the questions “What is helping you right now?” or “What problems are you having?”

**Problem**

How do you get student feedback to better understand how students are progressing in your class, what concepts they are struggling with, what might help them better succeed in the class, and/or what has helped them succeed so far.

**Context**

You have been teaching class of students for some time. The presentation style is mostly lecture with students engaged in answering questions about course content.

**Forces**

Some students are reluctant to honestly tell you their reactions to the lesson and to your class. They are comfortable answering questions related to the lesson, but are hesitant in offering feedback of a more personal nature. They may fear many things: upsetting you, looking inadequate to their classmates, or even that their grade may be negatively impacted.

You have spent time using **CraftedQuestions** (**SimpleAnswer** and **OpenEnded**) and have used **PregnantPause** consistently. When you try to get feedback of a personal nature such as how students are progressing in your class, what concepts they are struggling with, what might help them better succeed in the class, and/or what has helped them succeed so far, they are reluctant to answer.

In many classes, students are reluctant to ask questions when they lack understanding. Some are hesitant because they believe they will eventually understand the material. Others do not want to appear lost or may not know what questions to ask. Whatever the reason, students who don’t stop and ask questions feel lost in the course and don’t know how to tell you.

At other times students don’t give any indication how they think the course is progressing. They don’t freely express their likes or dislikes to you until the final day when course evaluations are given. They may have concerns that you may easily address, making the course better for them, if you were only told.

**Solution**

At the end of class, with a couple minutes to spare, hand out an index card to each student. Tell the students not to put their name on the card but to take a couple minutes to write whatever they need you to know. This could be a topic that isn’t quite understood, a specific question they would like to ask, or even an “aha” moment they have recently experienced. Encourage every student to be involved by writing anything they want you to know. If they have nothing to say, leave the card blank. Each student should drop a card in the box as they leave the room (whether or not it has anything on it), mixing it with the others to insure anonymity. You should address all questions and concerns during the next class if possible.

**Rationale**

You have been teaching a subject for awhile and know the material well. But the hang-ups that one class has are not necessarily the same in all classes. It is important for you to understand where your students are in the learning process. What is stumping them at this point may not have stumped other classes.
You need student feedback to better understand where they are, what concepts they may be struggling with, what they think of the class, or even what concept finally clicked with them. This feedback will help you to better design lectures, to steer discussions, and to build a healthy learning environment.

**Example**

Scott brought half-sheets of paper to his programming class. Four minutes before the end of the class, he passed out the half-sheets and explained to the students, “Write on this paper anything you think I need to know. Do not put your name on the paper and drop it off on the front desk when you leave.” The following are examples of what Scott learned from the students that day.

“Confused about the object-oriented solution, I need to look over more examples. I don’t like things in general terms, confuses me.” After reading this, Scott realized he needed to add more examples to his lectures.

“The last project, project 4 has really got me confused. I was fine in the class until the 2nd part of this assignment and then I felt like I didn’t know anything. Today helped a lot more. I wish this had happened earlier because I feel like I understand why I have three separate files now. It just seems it came too late.” This was discouraging to Scott since the lecture explained things but should have been earlier in the semester. He made a note to himself to use the lecture he just gave before project 4 for the next semester.

**Consequences**

Because of giving students time and an anonymous way of communicating, the teacher is able to understand the problems they are facing. The students are very open about where they are and the frustrations they face. This provides the opportunity to modify subsequent lectures to address the problems they are encountering.

A student may say something you cannot change. For example, “I think that the textbook that we use is really bad.” The textbook cannot be changed that semester, but prompts the teacher to re-evaluate the textbook for the next year.

There are other times when student comments contradict one another. For example some comments may indicate that too much time is spent on examples, where other comments indicate that not enough examples are given.

There are times your students give incredible feedback about how helpful the lecture was. One student wrote, “This Fraction class example has been very, very helpful. The explanation and review were refreshing and remind us of [what we learned].”
Summary

The **Continuous Feedback Patterns** introduced in this paper compliment the **Feedback Patterns** [5] and the **Active Learning Patterns** [6] that are included in the current work of the Pedagogical Patterns Community [7]. The objectives shared by our Continuous Feedback Patterns and the patterns described in the Pedagogical Patterns Project appear below in italics. Our Continuous Feedback Patterns can easily be incorporated into the Quick Access Tables and associated text provided for the Feedback[5] and Active Learner[6] pattern languages. Our goal is to have these patterns included in the larger Pedagogical Patterns Project. There are many objectives shared by our Continuous Feedback Patterns and the patterns described in the Pedagogical Patterns Project:

- All of the Continuous Feedback Patterns are intended to *maximize learning by engaging* [6].
- **Pregnant Pause** encourages the teacher to *take different skill levels and interests into account* [6].
- **Crafted Questions (Simple and Open Ended)** are designed *to build on the students past experiences and ensure that the students understand the topic* [5, 6].
- **Move Around** and **Three Stars And A Wish** are ways *to provide feedback that motivate the students* [5].
- **Look But Do Not Touch** and **Learning Contract** encourage the students *to be less dependent on the teacher and helps the student to learn from their own experiences* [5].
- **Three Stars and a Wish** allow for *the value of a student’s gained knowledge to be visible* to the other students [5].
- **Piece Of Mind** gives the teacher insight on the student's perspective of the course and whether *the course is useful to the student* [5].
- **Tell Me About It**, **Listen**, **Crafted Questions**, and **Delve The Depths** *ensure the students understand the topic*[5].

One common goal of all pedagogical patterns is to provide an insight into successful teaching techniques. Skillful teaching requires two-way communication. Teacher: Do you understand what I’m trying to teach you? Student: This is what I understand about what you’ve taught me. To borrow from the words of computer scientist Grady Booch, [Teaching] “is incremental and iterative.” At each stage both teacher and student need feedback to find out how they’re doing.

One could say that these feedback patterns in many ways reflect the Socratic Method of dialogue between teacher and student. Both the teacher and the student are responsible for learning. In our observations and discussions with colleagues and our personal classroom experience we have found these patterns to be key elements to successful teaching --- not merely rote learning and memorization but real understanding on the part of our students.
Authors

Kathy Larson has been teaching mathematics and computer science more than 30 years in grades ranging from middle school through graduate level. She currently teaches computer science for CIT majors and curriculum development for Education majors at Mount Saint Mary College, Newburgh, New York, and statistics at Marist College, Poughkeepsie, New York. She is particularly interested in implementing computer science curricula in grades K through 12.

Fran Trees has been teaching more than 30 years at grade levels ranging from middle school to graduate school and is presently teaching computer science at Drew University in Madison, New Jersey. She works closely with introductory computer science curricula in the high school and university settings and has been actively involved with the Advanced Placement Computer Science Program since 1985.

Scott Weaver has been teaching mathematics and computer science for over 15 years in grades ranging from middle school to college age. He is currently teaching Computer Science at Messiah College and is involved in informational sciences curriculum development.
References


